Grid – Distributed Computing at Scale An overview of Grid and the Open Grid Forum

Status of This Document

This document provides information to the Grid community. It does not define any standards or technical recommendations. Distribution is unlimited.

Copyright Notice

Copyright © Open Grid Forum 2006, 2007. All Rights Reserved.

<u>Trademark</u>

Open Grid Services Architecture and OGSA are trademarks of the Open Grid Forum.

Abstract

In today's global economy, organizations are being challenged to break down people, process, and technology silos that inhibit the flow of information, innovation and commerce. Individuals are being challenged to work in new ways – often in collaboration with other organizations, departments, and/or disciplines. This paper explains why Grid is the IT infrastructure solution being used by leading organizations around the world to enable this knowledge-based, global economy. It explains the role of grid technologies within the broader distributed computing landscape and defines three common usage patterns of grid today. It identifies the evolution of Grid technologies from application-specific solutions to dynamic, shared and service-oriented infrastructures. Finally, it describes the role that the Open Grid Forum plays in accelerating grid adoption in partnership with the grid community and the industry at large.

Contents

1.	Grid Perspectives	2
2.	Grid Usage Patterns	2
3.	Grids and other Distributed Computing Concepts	5
4.	Grid Adoption within Organizations and the Overall IT Industry	7
5.	The Open Grid Forum's Role in Accelerating Grid Adoption	9
6.	Membership in the Open Grid Forum	.10
7.	Author Information	.11
8.	Glossary	.11
9.	Intellectual Property Statement	.12
10.	Disclaimer	.12
11.	Full Copyright Notice	.12

1. Grid Perspectives

In the broadest sense Grids¹ can be thought of as a platform for all types of networkdistributed applications or services. By leveraging the network to integrate, aggregate, manage, and scale IT, your ability to solve problems is limited only by the resources you and your collaborators can connect together and manage effectively as a system. In this sense, Grids enable an organization to operate and manage distributed resources as a secure, robust, and flexible infrastructure – particularly as this infrastructure grows, shrinks and changes in response to your needs.

A narrower perspective of Grid is found in the diverse spectrum of application-specific deployments now in use today. Grids can be found in such diverse areas as collaborative scientific research, drug discovery, financial risk analysis, forecasting, design, simulation, business intelligence and transaction processing environments. They are justified not through their broad, distributed computing implications but through practical, application-specific requirements, technology tradeoffs and return-on-investment projections.

The tension between "Broad Grid" as any collection of distributed services, and "Narrow Grid" as defined by both specific technologies in use and the application focus served by these technologies has generated much discussion within the industry. On the one hand, the broad notion of Grids struggles for clarity in relation to other terms such as virtualization, service-orientation and even Web 2.0 as the IT industry seeks to better describe the continued evolution of Grids rightfully showcases what has been accomplished given a particular application workload in a particular industry, using currently available software components, products, and solutions – making it difficult for some to "connect-the-dots" to the broader distributed systems landscape.

Whether readers lean toward the broad or more narrowly focused interpretation of Grid, most experts agree that Grid and related technologies such as virtualization, automation and service orientation are critical to scaling IT – building at scale, operating at scale, managing at scale, and changing at scale to better enable IT to meet today's dynamic scientific, engineering, and business requirements.

2. Grid Usage Patterns

Between the broad interpretation of Grid as *application- agnostic,* distributed system infrastructure and the narrower, application-specific perspectives are several common usage patterns in operation around the world today including: High Performance Computing Grids, Collaborative Grids, and Data Center Grids.

High Performance Computing Grids - Grids emerged in the mid-1990s, when applications used by engineers and researchers were run on High Performance Computing (HPC) clusters to side-step the high costs of supercomputers. Clusters grouped together low-cost and often underutilized resources into a scale-out, grid-like infrastructure for primarily high performance/throughput applications. These early ancestors of grids – typically implemented within a single site of an organization, running

¹ See the glossary for a more detailed definition

on² a homogeneous suite of equipment – demonstrated the resource-sharing and scaling that grids enable for compute- and data-intensive applications and are the most widespread grid usage model today. They tend to be less dynamically deployed and more homogeneous in their construction.

Leading companies such as Citigroup and Johnson & Johnson (see sidebars) are operating multi-site grids in their enterprise production environments today.

Citigroup: Reducing Risk

Citigroup needed to rapidly respond to changing market conditions: dramatic growth in complex derivatives, increasing trade speed in many markets, the need to reduce time to market for new products and increasing regulatory oversight. To address these needs, Citigroup turned to grid technology to create a scalable mission critical platform that not only allowed them to reduce the time to complete these processes, but also gained them a competitive advantage.

Not surprisingly, the grids provide a cost effective resource for compute-intensive and data-intensive applications.

Johnson & Johnson speeds drug discovery

Building on the early success of a small-scale pilot grid in 2003, J&J today has an enterprise grid pooled from resources across the world. The grid runs dozens of applications that shorten the R&D time needed to bring new drugs out of the research labs and into clinical trials and commercial launch. Grid-based applications give their scientists the tools to simulate complex chemical compounds in far less time, and at a lower cost, than with other approaches. The grid also provides the scale and reliability needed by working teams throughout J&J sites to access shared, multi-terabyte datasets and speed drug discovery. Citigroup and J&J are examples of the growing trend by organizations to use grids to deliver to users – whether financial traders or research teams developing new drugs – a flexible and adaptive infrastructure. These and other capabilities have led Gartner Inc. to identify Grid computing as one of the top 10 technologies to watch in 2007.

Collaborative² Grids involve multiple organizations and individuals, security domains, protocols, discovery mechanisms, and heterogeneous hardware, collaborating to share their

resources to make the most effective use of it for their combined user communities. This permits the members of a distributed team (virtual organization) to exploit each others expertise in near- or real-time to achieve results that would be more difficult to achieve working separately or serially.

There are many examples of grids used for collaboration in widespread usage around the world –often enabled through government funding to advance scientific discovery and economic development within a country or region. These "regional grid infrastructures" include: ChinaGrid, TeraGrid and the Open Science Grid in the US, the German D-Grid Initiative, Japan's National Research Grid Initiative (NAREGI), The UK e-Science Program and EGEE and EGEE-II (Enabling Grids for E-sciencE) in Europe to name a few. For instance, EGEE provides a grid used for scientific collaboration by researchers on topics as varied as modeling drug effectiveness against the avian flu

² In a broad sense, all grids enable the sharing of resources, data, etc. However, here the focus is on Grids utilized by multiple organizations/individuals.

EGEE: Enabling collaborative discovery

Grid is the heart and soul of EGEE's ability to support over 100 "Virtual Organizations" of scientific endeavor. Their grid includes over 30,000 CPUs across more than 200 interconnected sites in 39 countries. A 2 Gbit/s transfer rate supports an average of 30,000 jobs per day, some using/generating multi-petabyte datasets. With this powerful architecture, EGEE can meet the evolving demands from their wide-spread communities. virus H5N1 to enabling physicists around the world to run their high energy physics experiments using the petabytes of data generated from the Large Hadron Collider (LHC) coming online during 2007. A massive grid (see sidebar), EGEE provides resources for compute- and data-intensive applications, but also provides the flexibility to meet the rapid

changes in which teams – across organizational boundaries – form, operate and disband. EGEE has found Grid delivers a flexible and adaptive resource that supports new collaborative models for scientific research.

Data Center Grids span one or more data centers and are in many ways as complete technically as Collaborative Grids. They involve the complete dynamic life cycle of service deployment, provisioning, management and decommissioning as part of their normal operation. At first glance, they may appear to be missing the aspect of multiple administrative domains, but that is typically an illusion. While the funding may come from a single source, and the administration carried out by a single organization, there is typically just as much tension among the various user entities as in a multiorganizational Grid.

eBay: Managing Commerce at Scale

"We have a grid-like computing architecture in which network-based scaling delivers the availability, adaptability and cost-effectiveness demanded by our business model. Standards-based interoperability and components will be an essential part of our ongoing ability to run applications on our grid platform."

Paul Strong, Distinguished Research Engineer, eBay Examples of Data Center Grids can be found in companies such as Amazon, eBay, and Google that support Internet-scale data centers and in organizations that provide IT as a "utility service" (either public or private). Operating at scale, managing at scale, and changing at scale is the life-blood of these organizations and many have invested significant time, effort and intellectual property in their data center architectures and technologies ahead of the availability of standard, "off-the-shelf" capabilities being available in the market. However, even these leading edge firms acknowledge the

importance of a comprehensive portfolio of production-proven grid-enabled products that are now becoming available today.

As grid technologies move mainstream, enterprise organizations are increasingly utilizing grid and related technologies to re-architect their enterprise data centers – breaking down existing application and information silos and moving toward shared and service oriented infrastructures. Enabling a more flexible and dynamic relationship between the changing needs of business and the supporting IT infrastructure is an important journey for many IT organizations – a journey enabled by grid and related distributed system technologies.

3. Grids and other Distributed Computing Concepts

Grids are at the heart of the IT architecture journey - from silo'd, statically bound applications and resources managed by manual processes to a new world of shared, dynamically provisioned resources that reliably delivers application services to users.

As shown in Figure 1, control of a grid solution is managed by middleware software, which provides a consistent set of services for applications to interact securely with instrument, network, compute, information, and storage resources, irrespective of their type or location. Grids include numerous development approaches and utilize a number of open source and commercial software platforms, modules, protocols, and capabilities to support an increasing range of applications within a distributed environment.



Figure 1 – Grid Services

Grid is a core concept in modern distributed computing architectures and is aligned with other important distributed computing technologies such as virtualization, service-orientation and data center automation. In a sense, Grids are enabled by virtualization, automation and service-orientation technologies and also integrate these technologies into a unifying solution – particularly across functional and organizational boundaries.

Grid integrates the concepts of application, data and system virtualization into a unifying platform that frees applications and data from being statically bound to dedicated infrastructure silos and provides a more flexible, shared environment to support IT services. Virtualization is the logical representation of a resource that is separated – abstracted – from its physical implementation. Virtualization is often thought of in terms of physical IT infrastructure components such as computers, storage or networks. For instance, sever virtualization is becoming increasingly popular in data centers around the world as organizations consolidate and then re-architect their IT infrastructure to improve utilization and overall flexibility. Server virtualization provides an abstraction layer that enables the partitioning of resources within a single physical system. These partitioned resources or "virtual machines" are encapsulated into files, making it possible to rapidly save, copy, and move a virtual machine (fully configured applications, operating systems, BIOS and virtual hardware) from one physical server to another. Grid compliments and extends server virtualization by pooling virtual and physical (non-

virtualized) server resources *across* a wide range of operating systems and platforms that are controlled and managed as a common resource. Resources can be pooled, shared and aggregated, whether they are in the same building or across the world. Grid also takes virtualization beyond the systems/component level in dealing with applications and data resources. Application virtualization enables application workloads to be matched with the appropriate collection of abstract systems resources to execute work. Requests are submitted to use these "abstract resources" including quality of service requirements such as completion schedules, security, etc. Application work is then scheduled and matched to appropriate resources from the pool of suitable and available resources – enforcing pre-defined policies and insuring successful job completion and/or graceful failover. Similarly, data virtualization provides access to data in an "abstracted" way enabling data in any format, at any location, to be accessed with appropriate security, performance, consistency, and coherency while masking complexity. This is accomplished through mechanisms such as data-aware routing, placement, caching, replication and movement.

Grids also support and exploit an increasingly popular architectural style for building and managing applications referred to as service-oriented architecture or SOA. SOA is a way of architecting software to support repeatable tasks (i.e. services). Services are modular building blocks isolated from the specific internal implementation details of other services and the underlying IT resource infrastructure. They are defined by the specific interfaces they publish and also hide the details of their implementation. Each service has a name, a purpose, and policies for things such as security and service levels. Services can be composed of and/or utilize other services to complete a specific task or job. The purpose of a service may be as simple as retrieving information or as complex as executing a business process. Service oriented architecture is a natural style both for use in implementing grid management middleware and as a pattern for applications intended to be hosted in grids. Services are largely written as relatively small containable functions and then aggregated or composed to build applications. Grids provide an ideal unifying infrastructure on which to run such loosely-coupled, composed, service-oriented applications given their capability of managing heterogeneous IT resources scaled across organizational and geographic boundaries. Grid middleware software components also exploit service-oriented concepts in their design and operation. Based on broadly adopted Internet and web services standards, these "Grid Services" enable the discovery of appropriate resources upon which to run applications, help to describe, execute and manage jobs, access and move data, and in general enable a robust and secure environment for the execution of a variety of scientific, engineering, and business applications.

Grids can also provide a unifying framework for policy-based automation. Automation is critical to managing the complexity of distributed systems - insuring required service levels are maintained based on pre-defined policies in a cost-efficient manner. For instance, Grid Services provide a control structure for the scheduling and provisioning of resources, the graceful failover of resources and the dynamic scaling of resources to meet workload demand based on policies set by the organization and/or IT professional. This ability to dynamically discover, assemble, operate and release the resources needed to accomplish a given application task securely is an important characteristic of grid technologies and a requirement for the cost-effective operation and management of distributed systems at scale.

"Modern IT infrastructure has grown and sprawled and interwoven without a lot of systematic pre-planning. It's really no wonder that it's exceedingly complex, discouragingly inflexible, and alarmingly fragile; it's no wonder that it's a complete nightmare to manage.

Unless we begin to grow IT in a thoughtful and architected way, we're just continuing to enlarge the pile – and all the problems that go along with that.

Grid is essential to IT because it's the architecture for gracefully adding new resources, and for dynamically adjusting resource allocations over time. Grid is all about scaling IT – not just for adding stuff to a pile, but for operating at scale, managing at scale, and changing at scale. There really is no alternative."

Jonathan Eunice Founder and Principal IT Advisor Illuminata

4. Grid Adoption within Organizations and the Overall IT Industry

Adoption of grid solutions can be viewed from both an overall IT industry perspective and an organizational perspective. From a broad IT industry perspective, the adoption model for grid is progressing in 3 phases: (1) early adoption; (2) proven solutions and (3) broad adoption as indicated by Figure 2 below.

	Early Deployments	Proven Solutions	Broad Adoption
"High Performance Computing Grids" HPC-oriented solutions for research and industry		Finance, Pharma, Research, Energy Engineering .	
"Collaborative Grids" Multi-organizational and/or regional grid infrastructures	Automotive, Aerospace design	Physics, Weather Forecasting	Barriers • Social • Licensing • Standards
"Data Center Grids" Shared and service- oriented infrastructures that span the enterprise data center	Enterprise Data Centers	Leading Internet-based businesses and emerging Utility Providers	

Figure 2 – Grid Adoption, Industry Perspective

Phase 1, "early adoption" is primarily an exercise in handcrafting solutions. In the "proven-solutions" phase, grid-enabled software from vendors is available and grid success stories in specific scientific disciplines and industry sectors are being shared. These proven solutions provide real-world examples of the benefits and risks of grid deployment and enable other organizations to leverage the successful experiences of the early pioneers. In the "broad-adoption" phase, mainstream users begin adopting grids and packaged solutions are available from a variety of providers. Moving to broad

adoption requires the "lessons learned" from early adoption, the "success patterns" from proven solutions and breaking through key standard, software licensing, security/administration policy, and social barriers associated with distributed systems. Standards are particularly important for broader, more mainstream adoption because they enable organizations to quickly and inexpensively connect grids within their organizations and/or interoperate with grids in external organizations (e.g., trusted partners, research collaborators). Breaking through these barriers and ensuring standards are in place is the work of the Open Grid Forum.

From an organizational perspective, adoption often progresses from a simple trial to a first successful implementation running a single specialized application. However, successful grids deployments are infectious and often lead to larger, more complex grid infrastructures that span multiple locations and extend to trusted partners and collaborators – ultimately influencing an organization's overall enterprise architecture. The illustration below (Figure 3) from the 451 Group, a leading grid and distributed computing analyst organization captures this progression from specialized solution to mainstream IT architecture – highlighting adoption by leading industries to date.



Grid Computing - The State of the Market

Figure 3 – Grid Adoption, Organizational Perspective

Today, organizations are adopting grid solutions and achieving significant benefits even without having all the standards in place for interoperability. This is particularly true for enterprises running the same version of one of the popular grid middleware software products. Interoperability becomes more critical as organizations connect grids to other grids within their organizations or with other organizations that utilize different grid middleware software. For those grids to come together and interoperate, they need to speak the same language.

5. The Open Grid Forum's Role in Accelerating Grid Adoption

As grid solutions become widely adopted, the need for interoperability and standards increases. The Open Grid Forum (OGF) is a Standards Development Organization (SDO) dedicated to developing open standards for grid interoperability. It serves as a global forum where the grid community gathers to identify common requirements, develop best practices and share use cases. OGF specifications are adopted and productized by software providers, referenced by SDOs working on complementary standards, and utilized by end users deploying grids.

The Open Grid Forum has a goal that commercial and academic organizations will build operational grids using OGF-defined, standards-based components by 2010. This work is well underway, however much more effort is needed to develop and mature specifications. In June 2007, OGF published its roadmap document entitled, "Technical Strategy for the Open Grid Forum 2007-2010"³. The document provides the distributed computing community with a sense of the maturity of existing grid specifications and gaps. It identifies six high priority capabilities including:

- **Grid Security:** to securely transfer data, authenticate users, and authorize access to resources
- **Application Provisioning**: to discover, describe, provision and manage the lifetime and lifecycle of software
- **Job Submission:** to submit jobs, query the status of running jobs, and cancel jobs that are executing on a distributed system
- File Movement: to move data and manage data including the ability to "cancel," "suspend," and "resume" when appropriate
- **Data Provisioning:** to handle files, databases, caching, transport, metadata, and federation at both the data and storage levels
- Grid Application Programming Interfaces (APIs): to provide programming interfaces and abstractions that provide stability across middleware technologies and the underlying protocols as they evolve

OGF recognizes that it takes cooperation and collaboration across the entire distributed computing community to effectively build open standards. For instance, many OGF standards are based on the foundational protocols, information, and web services standards developed by other standards development organizations (SDOs), including W3C, IETF, SNIA, DMTF, and OASIS. OGF proactively engages in liaison activities with these SDO's and they, in turn, look to OGF as uniquely chartered to define interoperable grid architectures, specifications and community practices. In addition, the vendor and open source community are the consumers of specifications and are key partners in their development. IT organizations on behalf of the users they support have a particularly critical role to play in encouraging vendors to deliver software based on industry standards and to provide software licensing models to support shared and

³ Published as GFD.113. However, as a living document, the most current version can be accessed at http://forge.ogf.org/sf/go/doc13748

service-oriented IT infrastructures. Finally government plays an important role in helping to encourage standards, insure a level playing field for all stakeholders, and set appropriate policies for access and ongoing support of grid infrastructures that enhance scientific discovery and economic development within their country or region.

OGF also engages extensively with other grid-related organizations throughout the world to ensure that we align globally but also communicate and collaborate locally. OGF affiliates include: Grid Consortium Japan, Grid Forum-Netherlands, Open Grid Forum-Korea, The Israeli Association of Grid Technologies (IGT), and Grid Forum-Singapore.

6. Membership in the Open Grid Forum

As a community-initiated organization, OGF involves more than 300 organizations from 50 countries. OGF has extensive engagement with the largest national/regional grid initiatives in 25 countries, such as TeraGrid[™] and Open Science Grid (U.S.), EGEE (Europe), NAREGI (Japan), APAC (Australia), and UK eScience (U.K.). Leading hardware, software, and solutions vendors such as Hewlett-Packard, IBM, Intel, Microsoft, Oracle, Platform Computing, and Network Appliance are also actively engaged. Finally organizations who provide grids to large numbers of end users such as Boeing, Micron, Shell Exploration, and eBay actively participate in the work of the organization.

Active membership in OGF provides the benefits of:

- **Insight** into technical directions, best practices, and the evolution and adoption of standards
- Influence on the priorities of the organization and the opportunity to be in leadership roles
- **Recognition** as a leader in the development of next generation of grid and distributed computing, or for individual contributions

The benefits of OGF membership to SAS

"Membership in OGF provides SAS a unique global forum in which we can exchange ideas with other leading organizations across the world and create common solutions for our customers to improve their business performance and reduce costs. The OGF standards and best practices are an important part of our plans to support our customers' business intelligence, data integration and analytic requirements across grid and distributed computing infrastructures.

Cheryl Doninger, R&D Director, SAS Institute Inc.

We encourage everyone interested in grids to participate in our community as we work to ensure the pervasive adoption of grids.

For more information on OGI	F, please visit one of the following:
General Information	http://www.ogf.org
Current List of Members	http://www.ogf.org/Members/members_members.php
Membership Program	http://www.ogf.org/Members/members_org_program.php
How to Get Involved	http://www.ogf.org/About/abt_getinvolved.php

7. Author Information

Mark Linesch, HP mark.linesch@hp.com

Additional Contributors: John Ehrig, OGF Nick Werstiuk, Platform Computing David Birnbaum, Pacific Horizon Group

8. Glossary

Capability	A set of one or more <i>services</i> that together provide a function that is useful in a <i>Grid</i> context. ⁶
Enterprise	The entire [business] organization ⁴
Grid	A system that is concerned with the integration, <i>virtualization</i> , and <i>management</i> of <i>services</i> and <i>resources</i> in a distributed, heterogeneous environment that supports collections of users and resources (<i>virtual organizations</i>) across traditional administrative and organizational domains (<i>real organizations</i>). ⁶
Grid Service	The formal definition of this term is deprecated. In general use, a Grid service is a <i>Web service</i> that is designed to operate in a <i>Grid</i> environment, and meets the requirements of the Grid(s) in which it participates. ⁶
High Performance Computing	The use of supercomputers and computer clusters, that is, computing systems comprised of multiple (usually mass-produced) processors linked together in a single system with commercially available interconnects. ⁵
Line of Business (LOB)	Divisions of a company responsible for the production and creation of the organization's products and/or services. IT, HR and Accounting are not lines of business. ⁶
Open Grid Services Architecture (OGSA)	Developed by OGF, OGSA is a grid-specific implementation of Web services that work with XML, SOAP and WSDL (among others) across multiple types of transport protocols (e.g., HTTP, SMTP).
Provisioning	The activity of specifying, <i>reserving</i> , <i>allocating</i> and <i>deploying</i> the set of <i>resources</i> required to accomplish a task. ⁶
Resource	A resource is an <i>entity</i> that is useful in a Grid environment. The term usually encompasses entities that are pooled (e.g. hosts, software licenses, IP addresses) or that provide a given capacity (e.g. disks, Networks, memory, databases). However, entities such as processes, print jobs, database query results and <i>virtual organizations</i> may also be represented and handled as resources. ⁶
Service Level Agreement (SLA)	A contract between a provider and a user that specifies the level of service that is expected during the term of the contract. They might specify availability requirements, response times for routine and <i>ad hoc</i> queries, and response time for problem resolution (network down, machine failure, etc.). ⁶
Services-Oriented Architecture (SOA)	This term is increasingly used to refer to an architectural style of building reliable distributed systems that deliver functionality as <i>services</i> , with the additional emphasis on loose coupling between interacting services. ⁶
Web Services (WS)	A software system designed to support interoperable machine- or application-oriented interaction over a network. ⁷

⁴ "The Computer Desktop Encyclopedia" by Alan Freedman, Second Edition. 1999
⁵ See http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/High_performance_computing
⁶ See http://it.csumb.edu/departments/data/glossary.html
⁷ See http://www.ogf.org/documents/GFD.81.pdf

9. Intellectual Property Statement

The OGF takes no position regarding the validity or scope of any intellectual property or other rights that might be claimed to pertain to the implementation or use of the technology described in this document or the extent to which any license under such rights might or might not be available; neither does it represent that it has made any effort to identify any such rights. Copies of claims of rights made available for publication and any assurances of licenses to be made available, or the result of an attempt made to obtain a general license or permission for the use of such proprietary rights by implementers or users of this specification can be obtained from the OGF Secretariat.

The OGF invites any interested party to bring to its attention any copyrights, patents or patent applications, or other proprietary rights which may cover technology that may be required to practice this recommendation. Please address the information to the OGF Executive Director.

10. Disclaimer

This document and the information contained herein is provided on an "As Is" basis and the OGF disclaims all warranties, express or implied, including but not limited to any warranty that the use of the information herein will not infringe any rights or any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose.

11. Full Copyright Notice

Copyright (C) Open Grid Forum 2006, 2007. All Rights Reserved.

This document and translations of it may be copied and furnished to others, and derivative works that comment on or otherwise explain it or assist in its implementation may be prepared, copied, published and distributed, in whole or in part, without restriction of any kind, provided that the above copyright notice and this paragraph are included on all such copies and derivative works. However, this document itself may not be modified in any way, such as by removing the copyright notice or references to the OGF or other organizations, except as needed for the purpose of developing Grid Recommendations in which case the procedures for copyrights defined in the OGF Document process must be followed, or as required to translate it into languages other than English.

The limited permissions granted above are perpetual and will not be revoked by the OGF or its successors or assignees.